



NGO Committee

# គណៈកម្មាធិការអង្កេតការងារមើលរដ្ឋាភិបាល ដើម្បីតាមដានទូទៅ

## សូចនាកររបស់វេទិកាកិច្ចសហប្រតិបត្តិការអភិវឌ្ឍន៍កម្ពុជា

### NGO Committee for the Monitoring of CDCF Indicators

Phnom Penh. September 29, 2009



## NGO Statement on the Monitoring of CDCF Indicators

### Table of Contents

Executive Summary ..... 1



### NGO Inputs for Discussions on the GDCC Agenda

NGO Perspectives on Planning: Civil Society Participation in NSDP Update 4  
NGO perspectives on linking the National Plan with the National Budget ... 5  
Impact of Economic Downturn on Household and Communities ..... 7



សម្ព័ន្ធភាពកម្ពុជា ដើម្បីឱ្យមានភាពច្បាស់លាស់  
CAMBODIANS FOR RESOURCE REVENUE TRANSPARENCY

### JMIs Monitoring

Land Sector ..... 10  
Forestry Sector ..... 15  
Public Financial Management, including revenues from natural resources 18  
Combat Corruption ..... 21  
Midwifery and Enhancement of national response to HIV/AIDS epidemic 24  
Education ..... 26



### ANNEXES

ANNEX 1: Hydropower Development in Cambodia ..... 29  
ANNEX 2: The Rights to Participation in Elections in Cambodia ..... 31  
ANNEX 3: Disability ..... 34  
ANNEX 4: National and International Non-Governmental Organizations on NGO and Association Law ..... 36



## Executive Summary

NGOs welcome this week's quarterly meeting of the Government-Development Partners Coordination Committee as an important opportunity to discuss (i) the NSDP Update, (ii) harmonization between the National Plan, national budget and development aid, (iii) monitor progress on Joint Monitoring Indicators (JMIs) agreed at last December's Cambodia Development Cooperation Forum, and (iv) receive an update on measures taken by the Royal Government that address the current economic crisis.



Many NGOs are at the moment trying to engage with various line ministries and central agencies of the Royal Government on the NSDP Update. NGOs appreciate the structure outlined by the Ministry of Planning which empowers the nineteen Technical Working Groups (TWGs) to draft sections of the NSDP Update. NGOs would note that this **mechanism for consultations between the Royal Government, its development partners and NGOs needs to be improved in order to have meaningful consultations on the first draft of the NSDP Update.** NGOs would also like to encourage the Royal Government to consult with more sections of civil society beyond the NGOs that are represented in 11 out of 19 TWGs.



វេទិកាសម្រាប់ការងាររបស់អង្គការមិនមែនរដ្ឋាភិបាល កម្ពុជា  
The NGO Forum on Cambodia



Forthcoming research report by the Cambodian Economic Association shows that the **impact of the current economic down-turn is severe for poor and vulnerable households**. It is absolutely necessary to increase and speed up delivery of assistance to groups that are most in need, especially in the coming months before the new harvest. Compared to last year, almost all surveyed groups report a significant reduction in their income with its negative consequences on health, food security, ability to repay debts, and education. With more limited options for common coping mechanisms (selling labor, migration, etc), many households are taking out loans for food, health expenses, and repaying existing debts. The **increased indebtedness** has the potential to lead to more problems in the near future if the current economic situation persists.

**The Sub-decree on Procedures for Registration of Land of Indigenous Communities** was passed in May 2009 through the commitment of the government. Although, civil society groups involving in this area have continuing concerns that the final version still does not adequately address concerns raised in response to earlier drafts. It is thought to be conflicting to the Land Law in some aspects such as it sets limits to areas of spirit forests and burial grounds where as the Land Law states that the boundaries of the immovable property of indigenous communities is set by the actual situation (not limits).

**Urban poor continue to face pervasive tenure insecurity and are routinely subjected to forced evictions, including inadequate consultation, notice, compensation and resettlement.** An ongoing serious concern is that the possession rights recognized in the 2001 Land Law, including the right to convert possession rights into full ownership rights, are not being respected consistently, particularly for the urban poor. NGOs are troubled that the titling and land dispute resolution system has excluded large segments of the population living on sought after land. Those who are excluded are labeled 'anarchic' and 'illegal squatters without title', which is used as a justification for their eviction and the denial of fair and just compensation.

Given the stated desire of the Ministry to adopt the **National Housing Policy** by the end of 2009, NGOs are concerned about whether sufficient time will be available for meaningful public consultation. The Policy should also provide for improved access to affordable basic services, infrastructure and housing loans for urban poor communities. It is important that there is enough time for a meaningful public consultation and subsequent revision of the National Housing Policy. While recognizing that this may delay the finalization of the policy beyond the deadline imposed by the JMI, NGOs believe that it is more important to ensure that the policy is satisfactory to all stakeholders and accords with Cambodia's laws and international treaty obligations.

NGOs are concerned after observing that **"community forestry" is being implemented in areas with land concessions**. While apparently a forward step, it is routinely report by communities that they are told they must accept the relatively small, disparate areas of community forestry while the rest of the area is taken for land concession activities. NGOs stress that the intent of community forestry cannot be realized if the broader issues of land allocation to concessions and general governance are not addressed.

In the recent design of the **National Forestry Programme (NFP)**, NGO's cannot see the added benefit of an additional policy instrument, like the NFP, if some of the core issues are not first addressed. NGO's can support the approval of the National Forest program only if there have been demonstration of political will to implement existing legal and policy instruments. A National Forest Program is not considered to be successful if not involving an appropriate community consultations process.

NGOs welcome the news that an **"Extractives Industries Fiscal Transparency Plan"** has been drafted by an inter-ministerial working group led by the Ministry of Economy and Finance. Contrary to what was announced in the most recent TWG-PFM meeting, NGOs working together in the Cambodians for Resource Revenue Transparency (CRRT)

coalition would like to note that they are not aware of consultations with NGOs or other civil society organisation around this plan. The CRRT looks forward to receive a draft copy of the plan and constructively engage with the Ministry of Economy and Finance and other members of the inter-ministerial working group. In addition to the “Extractives Industries Fiscal Transparency Plan”, NGOs understand that the Ministry of Economy and Finance gave its final approval of the 2006 National Audit Report on 11 September and look forward to the **publication of the 2006 National Audit Report** later this year.

NGOs appreciate that the Royal Government has finalized the draft penal code and submitted this to the National Assembly and would like to stress that the **Anti-Corruption Law** has to follow suit. NGOs urge the Royal Government to use the coming months to hold consultations on the current draft Anti-Corruption Law and make sure that the Anti-Corruption Law is in line with international best practices.

NGOs appreciate Government’s increased focus on primary education survival rates in rural and remote areas. In order to better understand the current constraints to **access to quality education, especially for vulnerable groups** such as those with disabilities, HIV-AIDS, ethnic minorities and the very poor, NGOs would like to have a separate meeting with the MoEYS and its development partners on this issue. In addition NGOs recommend that the MoEYS: (i) maintain well-trained contract teachers in remote schools as these schools will remain understaffed in the coming years and (ii) upgrade the quality of the teacher training program and establish a proper support mechanism for newly qualified teachers and schools in order to meet the target with quality.

One specific area of concern for Cambodia’s NGO community is the **increased prioritization and rapid development of hydropower dams** as a way to meet Cambodia’s energy needs. Large dams can produce large-scale environmental, social and economic impacts, which in turn may affect the livelihoods and food security of millions of Cambodians. For this reason, NGOs would like to request the Royal Government to improve energy planning processes through increased promotion of decentralized sustainable energies, while strengthening compliance and regulatory bodies and improving public consultation to ensure that the rights of project-affected communities are respected.

Another specific area of particular concern for Cambodia’s NGO community is the **upcoming legislation on NGOs and Associations in Cambodia**. Unquestionably, the NGO community in Cambodia, in partnership with the Royal Government of Cambodia and the development partners, has made a significant contribution to rebuilding Cambodia and addressing crucial issues including poverty, human rights and equitable resource allocation. That contribution of partnership with the Cambodian government, international organizations and the foreign donor community, has established Cambodia’s NGO community as an important stakeholder in Cambodia’s social and economic development. Therefore, we, the Cambodian NGO community, have serious legitimate concerns about aspects of the proposed legislation.

These concerns have been thoroughly discussed within the NGO community and collated in the joint **statement entitled “National and International Non-Governmental Organizations on NGO and Association Law”**. This statement has, to date, been endorsed by over 216 local and international NGOs (annex 4). We believe that that the drafting and passage of such a law requires a multi-stakeholder, comprehensive and broad-based consultation process to ensure that the resulting legislation reflects and articulates the best interests of Cambodia and Cambodians. In line with the joint statement, we are collectively advocating for *the establishment of an open and transparent consultation process for the drafting of the law, particularly with regard to its core principles, to ensure that the objectives are clear and the law results from thorough discussion and consensus.*

## NGO Perspectives on Planning: Civil Society Participation in drafting the NSDP Update 2009-2013

The valuable contribution that of the non-state actors can make to drafting a national plan been recognized by the Royal Government in the NSDP 2006-2010 where it states that: *"Ongoing efforts will be continued and strengthened to involve and associate all sections of the civil society in all appropriate aspects of RGC's planning and decision-making processes, and to make civil society an effective partner in the development efforts."*<sup>1</sup>

The mechanism used by the Royal Government for engaging with civil society in drafting the NSDP Update 2009-2013 is the 19 Technical Working Groups. NGOs appreciate this strategy that was outlined in circular from the Royal Government on the preparation of the National Strategic Development Plan Update, 2009-2013 but would like to take this opportunity to point out a number of limitations.

- There are 19 Technical Working Groups, 13 have NGO representatives. Technical Working Groups that have no NGO representative are: Legal and Judicial Reform, Mine Action, Private Sector Development, Public Administration Reform, Decentralization & De-concentration and Infrastructure and Regional Integration.
- There is more to civil society than NGOs, the Royal Government should extend its consultations to for instance religious organisations, labor unions, think-tanks, academia, and business associations.

As a preparation for this GDCC meeting, NGO Forum contacted 13 NGOs that participate in the Technical Working Groups. Of these 13 NGOs, only two were given the draft input for the NSDP Update through the Technical Working Group.

### ***Recommendations on improving consultation on the first draft of the NSDP Update***

Since there has not been much consultation in drafting the NSDP Update 2009-2013, NGOs would like to take this opportunity to share two recommendations to the Ministry of Planning (MoP) for improving this:

- ***Raise the current lack of engagement of line ministries/agencies with NGOs with the chair-persons of all TWGs.*** The MoP and the chair-persons of the TWGs have to come up with a strategy that allows for a meaningful consultative process with NGOs on the first draft of the NSDP Update after it has been published in the last week of October. Perhaps all Technical Working Groups can be requested to meet in the second half of November in order to discuss views from development partners, NGOs and other relevant civil society groups on the draft NSDP Update. NGOs would also like to request that the government representatives in the TWGs provide feedback on the NGO suggestions/comments on the first draft of the NSDP Update.
- Organize ***additional consultations with other sections of civil society*** such as religious organisations, labor unions, think-tanks, academia, and business associations.

**For more information on this statement, please contact:**

#### **The NGO Forum on Cambodia**

Mr. Chhith Sam Ath; Executive Director

Tel: 023-214 429

Email: [ngoforum@ngoforum.org.kh](mailto:ngoforum@ngoforum.org.kh)

Address: #9-11, street. 476, Sangkat Toul Tompoung 1, Khan Chamkarmorn, Phnom Penh. PO Box: 2295.

<sup>1</sup> Paragraph 4.25, NSDP 2006-2010

## NGO perspectives on linking the National Plan with the National Budget (incl. development aid)

The current lack of linkage between the national plan and the national budget (incl. development aid) was recognized in the 2008 Mid Term Review of the NSDP where it was reported among other short-falls and future challenges that "...within the RGC much needs to be done to: (a) enhance and improve interdepartmental and inter-ministerial collaboration; (b) make substantive progress to harmonise NSDP, PIP and annual budget processes; (c) harmonise the data bases of CRDB/CDC and MOP's PIP..."<sup>2</sup>

The lack of linkage between the NSDP and annual budget has been highlighted in NGO Forum's analyses of the National Budget which showed that in 2007 and 2008 national budget (both recurrent expenditure and capital expenditure) are not in line with priorities in the National Strategic Development Plan. Especially agriculture and rural development receive little funds in contrast to the high policy priority attached to these sectors in the NSDP. In addition to the non-alignment of the national budget allocations to NSDP priorities, our analysis shows that capital budgets in the MAFF; MoRD; and MoWRM<sup>3</sup> spent less than budgeted while recurrent budgets in MoI, MEF, and COM<sup>4</sup> spend more than foreseen in the National Budget.

As the current lack of linkage between the National Plan and the National Budget (including development aid) is a real barrier for further poverty reduction in Cambodia NGOs welcome that the MEF, SNEC, MOP, and CDC formed a working group early this year. However NGOs regret to hear during the recent Technical Working Group on Public Financial Management that this working group has not yet met and would like to **encourage the lead-ministry, the Ministry of Planning, to call for a meeting to assess what issues can be addressed on the short-term in the current draft of the NSDP Update 2009-2013.**

NGOs encourage the World Bank to fully support the Ministry of Planning and the other agencies in the Government working group to address this in the forthcoming NSDP Update 2009-2013. NGOs would like to use this opportunity to repeat **the suggestions it has made earlier for improving the link between the NSDP Update and the National Budget** in the table below:

Page <sup>5</sup>	Para	Responsible Ministry	Suggestion
50	4.10	MEF	For NSDP monitoring purposes, it is especially important that National Budget allocations can be categorized in one of the sectors of table 4.3 that outlines the NSDP allocations by sector. To <b>enable better monitoring of the NSDP</b> we request the MEF to change the format for the NSDP allocations to follow the same format as the National Budget which is by line ministry.
50	4.10	MEF	Revise the costing of NSDP implementation as announced in the circular <sup>6</sup> and explain the method in carrying out the costing. The costing of the full NSDP should be accompanied by an assessment of the likely resources and a prioritization of pipe-line projects.

<sup>2</sup> RGC (2008), "Mid Term Review of the National Strategic Development Plan 2006-2010", page 9

<sup>3</sup> Ministry of Agriculture Forestry and Fisheries; Ministry of Rural Development; Ministry of Water Resource and Meteorology

<sup>4</sup> Ministry of Interior; Ministry of Economy and Finance; and Council of Ministers

<sup>5</sup> Please note that the page number and paragraph numbers in the table refer to the Mid Term Review 2008, which is the reference document for preparation of the NSDP Update 2009-2013.

<sup>6</sup> RGC (2009), Circular on the preparation of the NSDP Update 2009-2013, 28 May 2009

**For more information on this statement, please contact:**

**The NGO Forum on Cambodia**

Mr. Chea Kimsong, Development Issues Programme Manager

Address: #9-11, st. 476, Toul Tompoung 1, Phnom Penh

Tel: +855 23-214 429

Fax: +855 23 994 063

Email: [kimsong@ngoforum.org.kh](mailto:kimsong@ngoforum.org.kh)

Website: [www.ngoforum.org.kh](http://www.ngoforum.org.kh)

# Impact of Economic Downturn on Household and Communities: Livelihood, Food Security, and Debt

## *Introduction*

This statement summarizes some of the findings of the forthcoming research report from the Cambodian Economic Association (CEA) on "*Impact of the Economic Downturn on Households and Communities in Cambodia*" which was commissioned by Oxfam and the NGO Forum on Cambodia in May 2009. Researchers from the CEA and 12 interviewers in July 2009 conducted a survey of 1070 households representing 3,769 households in 15 communities<sup>7</sup> selected from diverse economic occupations in various parts of the country in order to assess the significance of the impact of the economic downturn, the ability of households to deal with the negative shocks, and their outlook for the next months.

The completed study will be disseminated in October and a public seminar will be organized by the NGO Forum on Cambodia to present the findings and discuss these together with findings from similar on-going research from UNDP, ILO, the World Bank-CDRI and so on.

## *Challenges on Household Income and Livelihood*

The economic downturn found to have negative impact on people from all walks of life, however, the severity of the impacts varies according to the resilience capacity or economic status of each community. Further to the difficulties experienced during the high food prices period, downturn has pushed those vulnerable community deeper into poverty.

- ***Households that are experiencing significant negative impact from the economic downturn include:*** i) urban poor and tourism dependent households as majority of them lost their jobs in garment, construction and tourism industry and suffered from drop in sale of tourism related business; and ii) rural households depending on income from cash crops, dry season rice, and wet season rice as their net profits decreased significantly from the previous year because of decline in the sale price of those products while the production costs were high the planting season.
- ***Fishing and the poorest rural households continued to face with largest proportion of difficulties*** from last year impact of high food prices to current negative impact of the downturn. Being landless and land poor, fishing households depend largely on fishing while poorest rural households rely mainly on income from small farming, selling labor (for fishing / agriculture / forest clearing/ other industry), and remittances. Decline in fish catch, reduced agricultural products prices, and increasing farming cost as well as a drop in selling labor make income of those households decline. 77% of surveyed fishing households reported that their income has decreased comparing to the previous year.
- The economic downturn has a bigger impact on these particular household groups than the food crisis in 2008 as they face not only with reduction in their income generated by drop in earning activities, but also with high food and commodity prices. It results in many difficulties for those households, which the most significant ones include: (i) lack of sufficient income to support health expenses; (ii) food shortage/insecure; (iii) inability to repay debts; (iv) lack of money for child education and so on.

## *Threat on Food Security*

- ***Across villages, community households are facing with food shortages and food insecurity.*** Fishing, poorest rural, tourism dependent, urban poor households are most vulnerable to food insecurity in this lean period as many of them are

---

<sup>7</sup> Each community represented by each village surveyed.

landless and land-poor. 85% of the landless are reported as facing food insecurity while many of land poor (0-1ha) find themselves in shortage of food. 63% of all surveyed households eat two meals per day while the rest has eaten three meals. Even though many of rural villagers have stock of both paddy and milled rice, 82% of them do not have stock of milled rice exceeding 50kg held in their home which is not sufficient to bridge them in coming months till the next harvest. Furthermore, female-headed households in rural villages are more vulnerable to food insecurity as they have smaller amount of stock of paddy and milled rice. Thus, it can be foreseen the difficulty of food shortage for their household consumption in coming months. The study shows that **61% of surveyed rural households expect they may have food insecurity until next harvest**. Hence, in the case that income will continue to be low, the food shortage will likely be severe.

- The current ripple effect of the economic downturn further adds to the severity of food shortage that households and communities in Cambodia are facing. The pattern of household expenditure on food consumption within the circumstance of economic downturn phenomenon is similar to that during the high food prices in 2008 **with many households across villages coping with the current impact by decreasing their food consumption, relying on less expensive (and nutritious) food, purchasing food on credits etc. To make ends meet from the reduced income, 42% of 1,070 households in 15 target villages decreased their food expenditure in July 2009 compared to March 2009** and the decrease in food expenditure is proportionally highest among households in fishing and wet-season rice villages. Women, children and elder people might eat less to leave more for men as they earn income for the family. Consequently, people's nutrition condition is likely being squeezed by economic pressure.

#### **Severity of Indebtedness**

- Besides reducing food consumption, seeking for income-generation activities such as seasonal migration, labor work in construction or other migration-related works are usually common coping measure for these households. However, in the current depressed economy, it's less often possible as the availability of income/ economic opportunities are narrowing. Thus, **debt-related measures such as purchasing food on credits and taking loans are also rising**. According to the finding of this study, 71% of the respondent households are currently in debt, in which 70% of the debt incurred between January and July 2009 and 15% in the second half of 2008. Figure is high for fishing surveyed households which 91% of them are in debt.
- The first reason of taking loan is for agricultural production and business expansion which can help households to improve their livelihood but only one third of loans taken by households were reported as making the family better off. **The second reasons of taking loan are for food expenses, health expenses and repay the old debt**. The study shows that 44% of loans were reported to deal with food expenses. They are non-productive loans which is hard for people to payback, in particularly with high interest rate of current accessible loans. Falling in income plus existing debt of the households put more pressure on their ability to repay debts. Negative circumstance of debt might get worse in the near future and put people into deeper poverty if any responses might not be addressed timely and effectively. Improving food security and public health service can be one of the critical mechanisms to address the debt issues, especially to non-productive loans.

#### **NGO Recommendations to the Royal Government and Development Partners:**

- Increase and speed up delivery of assistance to the groups that are most in need, especially in the coming months before the new harvest.
- Monitor the effectiveness of the implementation of current policy responses to ensure that programs addressed food security reach the most affected groups.



- Improve and Expand public service delivery (health and education), especially ensuring free health care and education services with quality to people.
- Increase employment opportunities in the rural areas through food/cash for work programs at marginalized communities through rural infrastructure development (roads, schools, health centers, etc) and sustainable agriculture development (irrigation projects, canals, community ponds, etc).
- Increase public investment in agriculture: The package could include increased input subsidy, food-grain storage facilities, guaranteed access of subsidized credit, employment guarantee schemes, research and development for adaptive technology and seed protection.
- Improve trade and investment environment to attract more investment to create more jobs.

**For more information on this statement, please contact:**

**Prepared by: Economic Development Network (EDN)**

**The NGO Forum on Cambodia**

Mr. Chea Kimsong, Development Issues Programme Manager

Address: #9-11, st. 476, Toul Tompoung 1, Phnom Penh

Tel: +855 23-214 429

Fax: +855 23 994 063

Email: [kimsong@ngoforum.org.kh](mailto:kimsong@ngoforum.org.kh)

Website: [www.ngoforum.org.kh](http://www.ngoforum.org.kh)

# Land Sector

## 1. Joint Monitoring Indicators

Target	Actions Needed	Responsible Government Institution
8. Implement the legal framework established by the Land Law	<p>1. Indigenous communal land:</p> <p>a) A sub-decree on the procedures for registration of lands of indigenous people's communities is adopted in 2009 and a fully financed work and staffing plan is in place for scaling up indigenous communal titling to the communities</p> <p>b) Interim protective measures to safeguard communal land are evaluated.</p> <p>2. Land tenure – urban poor: A <i>Housing Policy</i> that includes the provision of secure land tenure for the urban poor is drafted with high priority and given as input into the Comprehensive Land Sector Policy ("White Paper").</p> <p>3. Land management: A <i>Spatial Planning Policy</i> that spells-out the hierarchy of land use planning and zoning is drafted and given as input into the Comprehensive Land Sector Policy ("White Paper") including a legal framework to support the implementation.</p>	<p>CLP, MOI</p> <p>CLP, MLMUPC, PHN Provincial Governor's office</p> <p>MLMUPC, CLP</p>

## 2. Monitored progress on Actions Needed

### 2.1 Indigenous communal land

#### *a) A sub-decree on the procedures for registration of lands of indigenous people's communities*

In May 2009 the *Sub-decree on Procedures for Registration of Land of Indigenous Communities* was passed. Community groups, NGO's and development partners were provided a first draft for comment. Although many people working in this area have continuing concerns that the final version still does not adequately address concerns raised in response to earlier drafts, as the sub-decree is now in place, the focus should be on how it can be implemented to assist in securing the land tenure of Cambodia's indigenous peoples.

The sub-decree that was passed has been generally regarded as problematic. It is thought to be conflicting to the Land Law in some aspects such as it sets limits to areas of spirit forests and burial grounds where as the Land Law states that the boundaries of the immovable property of indigenous communities is set by the actual situation (not limits).

Under the sub-decree, no *land* can be registered until the actual *community* is registered as a legal entity. Registering communities is the responsibility of the Ministry of Interior (MOI), but no legal framework for this currently exists. Four communities have successfully been registered in Mondulhiri and Ratanakiri using an *ad hoc* administrative procedure, and NGOs have seen the work plan of the Ministry of Interior to use the procedure developed in these cases to register more villages, *in lieu* of a legal framework.

Other comments provided by Community groups, NGO's and development partners were similarly not adopted. The protection provided to indigenous communities by the sub-decree is therefore considered to be low. All groups stated that the timeframe for comment was insufficient and that a re-draft should be provided for another round of comment.

***b) Interim protective measures to safeguard communal land are evaluated***

It is insufficient that, 8 years after the passing of the land law, the interim protective measure within the law are just "evaluated". NGO's and community groups believe that, during 2008 and 2009, the Royal Government of Cambodia has prioritized rapid and industrial models of development within indigenous areas. This has involved (or is in preparation for) extensive natural resource extraction which has alienated of indigenous peoples from their lands. In addition to this, many civil society attempts to protect their rights have been frustrated by mis-information and intimidation.

"Interim protective measures" as defined by the Government and many donor programs have not been implemented. NGO's and community groups also believe that a focus on legal framework and the registration of indigenous communities as legal entities is inadequate. A genuine interpretation of "interim protective measures" would focus on implementation of existing elements of Cambodian law, such as implementation of article 23 of the Land law - which was designed to protect indigenous peoples land prior to titling, and the sub-decree on Economic Land Concessions (which would involve cessation/cancellation of economic land concession on the lands the lands of indigenous peoples).

In order to do this, significant improvements in legal conflict resolution are required and we have not seen these. Also required is a decrease in intimidation and threats towards civil society actors who are attempting to support implementation of existing legal instruments, good governance and livelihoods protection. In fact we have seen an increase in intimidation and threats.

Mining concessions are also becoming an increasing threat to indigenous peoples land. Huge mining concessions have been issued in recent years, some of them apparently to agro-industrial development companies. We wonder the intent of issuing such concessions, well beyond the size required for appropriate mining activities. We are also very concerned about the lack of transparency of these mining concessions.

***2.2 Land tenure – Urban Poor***

***a) Progress made***

NGOs welcome the steps made by the MLMUPC to develop a National Housing Policy to ensure tenure security for the urban poor, in accordance with JMI 8.2. NGOs also welcome the engagement from the GTZ technical advisor working with the Ministry on the draft policy to receive input in this process from NGOs and communities during the initial stages of the drafting process. NGOs appreciate the verbal assurances we have received from the technical advisor there will be meaningful consultation on the policy once it is drafted.

***b) Shortfalls:***

Urban poor continue to face pervasive tenure insecurity and are routinely subjected to forced evictions, including inadequate consultation, notice, compensation and resettlement. Most recently, we have seen the Group 78 community and the communities surrounding Boeung Kak subjected to pressure and intimidation to accept inadequate compensation for their homes and land. These communities have been unable to utilize the existing legal and regulatory framework to secure their land rights.

An ongoing serious concern is that the possession rights recognized in the 2001 Land Law, including the right to convert possession rights into full ownership rights, are not being respected consistently, particularly for the urban poor. In some cases, such as that of the Group 78 community, there has been interference with the possession rights of families before the creation of cadastral index maps, which is a violation of Article 248 of the Land Law. Communities such as Group 78 have been unable to have their dispute resolved by the Cadastral Commission, despite presenting sufficient documentation of their possession rights.

In other cases, such as that of the communities surrounding Boeung Kak, households with well-documented possession rights have been denied title during the process of systematic registration because the municipal authorities unilaterally excised the area from the adjudication based on the premise that it was State land. This *de facto* classification of state land and excision from systematic land registration by the municipal authorities does not follow the Sub-decree on the Procedures to Establish Cadastral Index Map and Land Register<sup>8</sup> or the spirit of the Sub-decree on State Land Management.<sup>9</sup>

NGOs are troubled that the titling and land dispute resolution system has excluded large segments of the population living on sought after land. Those who are excluded are labelled 'anarchic' and 'illegal squatters without title', which is used as a justification for their eviction and the denial of fair and just compensation.

NGOs are also concerned that on 27 August 2009, the Royal Government of Cambodia issued a statement declaring its intention to establish an Inter Ministerial Taskforce to formulate Draft Directives on Squatter Settlement Resolution in urban areas. It appears from this statement that these directives will cover many of the same areas intended to be covered by the National Housing Policy, raising questions about the potential for harmonisation of both documents and the relative functions of each.

Given the stated desire of the Ministry to adopt the National Housing Policy by the end of 2009, NGOs are concerned about whether sufficient time will be available for meaningful public consultation.

### **3. Future direction for both government and development partners**

#### ***3.1 Indigenous communal land***

It is essential that progress be made towards completing and implementing the legal framework on the registration of indigenous communities so that indigenous land registration can be implemented rapidly and across all areas of the country where indigenous communities reside. In the meantime, the Ministry of Interior should rapidly scale-up registration of indigenous communities using the *ad hoc* procedure. In order to prevent further alienation of indigenous land, the government and development partner actions for 2009 and 2010 need to focus on protection of land prior to titling. This is basically implementation of the existing legal framework, inclusive of the Land Law, The sub-decree on Economic Land Concessions, the Contract Law, and Forestry Law, as well as others. Some measures should include raising awareness of indigenous communities, neighboring communities, and local officials of their specific rights and responsibilities under the Land Law.

Legal aid should also be provided to indigenous communities involved in land disputes. Economic Land Concessions, Mining Concessions and hydro-power projects should be suspended and no new concessions granted in indigenous areas until the process of land registration has been completed, and until an adequate legal framework for expropriation is in place. Continued progress in this area requires cooperation of all stakeholders, including the Ministry of Interior (MOI), Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries

---

<sup>8</sup> Royal Government of Cambodia, No. 46ANK.BK, Sub-decree on the Procedures to Establish Cadastral Index Map and Land Register, May 31, 2002.

<sup>9</sup> Royal Government of Cambodia, No 118 HNK/BK, Sub-Decree on State Land Management.

(MAFF), Ministry of Rural Development (MRD) and the Ministry of Industry, Mines and Energy (MIME).

Nevertheless, in order to strengthen the rights of indigenous communities under these existing laws, it is recommended that a rapid and interim recognition of indigenous status be provided to indigenous villages/sub-villages wishing this status and meeting a simple requirement such as >50% of residents being indigenous.

There is an urgent need for a public display from the highest level of government that indigenous land rights will be respected as per Cambodian Law. Key cases of indigenous peoples land alienation need to be reversed:

1. At least one key case, such as Kong Yu village, Ratanakiri, where a powerful individual has acquired land allegedly contrary to Cambodian law.
2. At least one key, large land concession that was granted in indigenous people's areas not in line with Cambodian Law. Suggested cases are in Andong Meas District of Ratanakiri and in Bousra Commune, Pich Chenda District, Mondolkiri.
3. At least one key case of legal charges against community human rights defenders where they have been attempting to protect community land rights against land infringement. Suggested cases are Snoul District, Kratie, and Lumphat District, Ratanakiri.

Prey Lang, in the junctions of Stung Treng, Kratie, Preah Vihear and Kompong Thom Provinces is the largest, single, contiguous tract of indigenous people traditional forest areas in the country. It is also the largest area of lowland evergreen forest left in South-East Asia. It is currently under threats from industrial development and requires special attention.

The Mining Law urgently needs a review to ensure that it does not allow or promote the violation of indigenous people's lands and the principles of good governance.

### ***3.2. Security of tenure for the Urban Poor***

As indicated above, NGOs welcome the steps already taken to engage in meaningful consultation and dialogue with relevant stakeholders in the drafting of the National Housing Policy and encourage the continuation of this dialogue throughout the drafting process.

The guiding RGC policy on informal settlements should be the *National Housing Policy*. Any further directives or amendments to the legal framework should be based on this policy.

In order to secure the land tenure of the urban poor, the Housing Policy must include a temporary moratorium on evictions and resettlement until such time as all settlements are properly surveyed to determine the legal status of households and appropriate tenure options.

All legal possessors must have access to the titling system, including those living in so-called 'disputed areas'. Titling in areas likely to be disputed will require increasing the capacity of the Administrative Commissions and also an increased level of cooperation and communication with the Cadastral Commission. If necessary, funds should be diverted to the Commission so that it can fulfill its responsibility to resolve disputes in a just, transparent and timely manner.

The practice of *de facto* state land management must end. State land should be identified, demarcated, and registered through a transparent process, in accordance with the procedures laid down in the Sub-decree on State Land Management, prior to or simultaneously with private individual titling.

The RGC should make a specific commitment to prioritizing systematic registration in urban poor areas and any areas slated for development. Article 248 of the Land Law, which requires adjudication and the creation of cadastral index maps before any interference with possessory rights, should be respected. Resettlement areas should also be prioritized for systematic land registration.

The rights of households in informal settlements (those without legal possessory rights under the Land Law) must also be protected by the National Housing Policy. The policy should include appropriate alternative tenure options for those households ineligible for ownership rights, such as onsite Social Land Concessions or medium-term leases from the State. The National Housing Policy should provide for resettlement only if necessary because the area is hazardous or not suitable for upgrading. If resettlement is absolutely necessary, it must be carried out in accordance with Cambodia's treaty obligations under the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, and should result in secure tenure at the new site.<sup>10</sup>

The National Housing Policy should also provide for improved access to affordable basic services, infrastructure and housing loans for urban poor communities.

It is important that there is enough time for a meaningful public consultation and subsequent revision of the National Housing Policy. While recognizing that this may delay the finalization of the policy beyond the deadline imposed by the JMI, NGOs believe that it is more important to ensure that the policy is satisfactory to all stakeholders and accords with Cambodia's laws and international treaty obligations.

**For more information on this statement, please contact**

**The NGO Forum on Cambodia**

Mr. Pen Raingsey, Land and Livelihoods Programme Manager

Tel: +855 23 214 429

Fax: +855 23 994 063

Email: [raingsey@ngoforum.org.kh](mailto:raingsey@ngoforum.org.kh)

Website: [www.ngoforum.org.kh](http://www.ngoforum.org.kh)

---

<sup>10</sup> See UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, General Comment 7, 1997.

# Forestry Sector

## 1. Joint Monitoring Indicators

Target	Actions Needed	Responsible Government Institution
9. With the aim of stopping the loss of Cambodia's forest resources responding to CMDG and Rectangular Strategy to support Sustainable Forest Management for rural poverty reduction and climate change mitigation. The legal frameworks established by the Forestry Law, Protected Area Law, Land Law, Mining Law, and in particular the Sub- Decree on Economic Land Concessions must be fully implemented at all levels of Government agencies, whilst prioritizing the finalization of National Forest Program and Community Forestry development.	1. Implement all provisions of the applicable laws and regulations, including establishing and making public the log book of Economic Land Concessions, Mining Concessions and other concession forms under the jurisdiction of MAFF, MoE, MIME.	MAFF, MOE, MIME
	2. At least 1,000 Km of forestland boundary and two more protected areas demarcated both on the map and ground.	FA, MAFF, MOE
	3. At least 100 Community Forestry Sites and 10 Community Protected Areas officially approved.	FA, MAFF, MOE
	4. Finalize and approve the National Forest Program in September 2009; and start its implementation by the end of 2009.	FA, MAFF

## 2. Monitored progress on Actions Needed

### ***2.1 Establishing and making public the log book of Economic Land Concessions, Mining Concessions and other concession forms,***

MAFF and MIME have provided much information about economic land concessions on a website for this purpose. NGO's have used this information as well as other information to provide a fuller picture of the extent of concessions publicly disclosed in Cambodia. This is made available at [www.sithi.org](http://www.sithi.org)

It should be noted that the official government websites do not constitute what NGO would regard as a full log book of concessions.

In addition to this, it is reiterated that a 2007 report by the UN Special Rapporteur for Human Rights stated:

*"At the root of these concerns is poor enforcement of and compliance with the requirements of the Land Law and Sub-Decree on Economic Land Concessions, which govern the grant and management of economic land concessions. Essential pre-conditions to the grant of concessions, such as the registration of land as state private land and conduct of public consultations and environmental and social impact assessments, have not been met. Likewise, restrictions on the size and ownership of economic land concessions have not been properly enforced. Individuals have used different companies to acquire interests in multiple concessions, contrary to the Land Law, and to obtain adjacent concessions for the same purposes, circumventing the 10,000 hectare size limit. Concessions have been granted over forested areas and former forest concessions, contrary to the Forestry Law and forestry regulations. Despite these*

*breaches of the law, there has been no systematic review of concessions, as required by the Sub-Decree on Economic Land Concessions. Further, the judicial system has failed to uphold the rights of affected communities and respect for the law, and to hold companies accountable for their actions."*

NGOs have seen a continuing issuance of new Economic Land concessions, many of them over forest areas, indigenous peoples' areas and over land with private rights.

## ***2.2 At least 100 Community Forestry Sites and 10 Community Protected Areas officially approved***

A number of NGO have observed that "community forestry" has been implemented in areas with land concessions. While apparently a forward step, it is routinely report by communities that they are told they must accept the relatively small, disparate areas of community forestry while the rest of the area is taken for land concession activities. As noted above, the majority of the land concessions have not been issued in line with Cambodian Law and it appears that, in many cases, community forestry is being used to placate communities to accepting the loss of their land and forest livelihoods to concessions.

Under these conditions, the supposed merits of community forestry need to be reviewed. In other countries, this combination of community forestry for small areas whilst other areas are industrialized has resulted in loss of community and eventually loss of community forest.

The intent of community forestry cannot be realized if the broader issues of land allocation to concessions and general governance are not addressed.

## ***2.3 Finalize and approve the National Forest Program in September 2009; and start its implementation by the end of 2009.***

The National Forest program is a worthy goal but needs to be implemented in a manner respectful of the fact that local communities have been the traditional managers of forest and have those forests as the basis for their livelihoods. It is not possible for NGO's to support a National Forest Program that has not been derived with extensive community level consultations. To date this has not happened despite requests from community groups.

Cambodia already have the Land Law, the Forest Law, the sub-decree on Economic Land Concessions, the National Development Strategy, the sub-decree on registration of indigenous peoples land. These legal and policy instruments have not been properly implemented - and this is the main cause of degradation of forests in Cambodia.

Cambodian communities are now suffering a loss of livelihoods as a result and the environmental stability of Cambodia is endangered because of the loss of the forest to concessions and powerful individuals. The situation with regard to governance has deteriorated to the stage to the stage where there has been widespread and serious intimidation of community people attempting to protect their resource rights.

NGO's cannot see the added benefit of an additional policy instrument, like the NFP, if some of the core issues are not first addressed. NGO's can support the approval of the National Forest program only if there have been demonstration of political will to implement existing legal and policy instruments. Specifically required are:

1. A community consultation process to community level done by civil society stakeholder and reported to multi-stakeholder forums. This will require funding and a period of 6 months.
2. Economic Land Concessions over 10,000ha are reduced to below 10,000ha or cancelled.



3. Any Economic Land Concession not in line with Cambodian law is suspended.
4. Community people currently in jail on charges of defamation or destruction of property against land grabbers and concessionaires have their cases reviewed and charges dropped if the ownership/possession claims of land by land grabbers and concessionaires are less legal than the claims of community people affected.
5. Economic land concessions on the traditional lands and forests of indigenous peoples are immediately suspended and then cancelled.

Another major concern in the NFP is that the definition of "forest" is too broad and opens the way for many industrial plantations to be included in the definition of "forest". NGO's and other civil society groups believe there are other ways to more efficiently support national economic development that the transformation of natural forest (which people rely on) to industrial plantations and want to see clear limits to the conversion of natural forest to industrial plantations.

### **3. Future direction for both government and development partners.**

The current indicator ("Implement all provisions of the applicable laws and regulations...") is far too broad for staged implementations. The detail within the current indicator ("establishing and making public the log book....") is, however, insufficient for the respect of Cambodian people rights, given the conditions that are prevalent at the moment.

A moratorium on industrial concessions is required.

A National Forest Program is not considered to be successful if not involving an appropriate community consultations process.

**For more information on this statement, please contact:**

**The NGO Forum on Cambodia**

Mr. Pen Raingsey, Land and Livelihoods Programme Manager

Tel: +855 23 214 429

Fax: +855 23 994 063

Email: [raingsey@ngoforum.org.kh](mailto:raingsey@ngoforum.org.kh)

Website: [www.ngoforum.org.kh](http://www.ngoforum.org.kh)

# Public Financial Management, including revenues from natural resources

## 1. Joint Monitoring Indicators

Target	Actions Needed	Responsible Government Institution
19. PFM Reform program	a) Implement and monitor stage 2 consolidate action plan;	MEF, LMs
	b) Achieve agreed milestones and indicators under stage 2 performance monitoring frame-work.	MEF, LMs

## 2. Monitored progress on Actions Needed

Among the many actions in the Public Financial Management Reform program (PFMR), NGOs pay special attention to those actions that will make a direct change to the level of transparency in Royal Government's management of Cambodia's public finances, including the revenues from the extractive industries: mining, oil, and gas.

### *Monitored Actions and Targets from the PFM Reform – Stage 2*

No.	Activity	2009 Target
11.2	Develop and implement oil/gas/mining revenue policy, mechanisms for transparent management of related revenue flows including EITI, and revenue assessment and collection capacity.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Initiate implementation of EITI.</li> </ul>
25.4	Improve forms of reporting to and communication with the public.	At least 4 of the following documents are made available: 1) Budget documentation; 2) In year budget reports; 3) Year end financial statements; 4) External audit reports; 5) Contract awards; 6) Resources available to primary service units

### 2.1 Oil/gas/mining revenue policy, transparent management, EITI (No. 11.2)

- As announced on the MEF web-site and in the TWG-PFM meeting of 14 September 2009, NGOs are aware that an inter-ministerial working group has been officially formed in February 2009 which is tasked to develop an *"Extractives Industries Fiscal Transparency Plan"*. At the most recent TWG-PFM meeting NGOs were informed by the MEF that this plan has been developed with NGOs in a consultative manner and that a formal meeting to discuss it with NGOs is being planned. NGOs in the Cambodians for Resource Revenue Transparency (CRRT) Coalition welcome this positive development but need to note that none of the NGOs in the coalition were consulted in the drafting process. As requested in a letter from the CRRT to the Chairman of the inter-ministerial working group, ***the CRRT looks forward to receiving a draft of the plan and constructively engaging with the Ministry of Economy and Finance and other members of the working group.***
- NGOs have noted ***a positive change in the aggregated version of the monthly Table on Financial and Economic Operations (TOFE)***, which is published on the web-site of the Ministry of Economy and Finance<sup>11</sup>. The monthly record of government revenues and expenditures now includes a memorandum item called *"revenue from extractive industry."* Although the inclusion of such a category is positive, it needs to

<sup>11</sup> On 16 September, the TOFE covering Jan - May 2009 was the most recent version on [www.mef.gov.kh/share.php](http://www.mef.gov.kh/share.php)

be noted that for every recorded month in 2009 (Jan – May), the reported value of the revenue is zero. Further, it remains unclear what sorts of revenue fall within this category.

## 2.2 Improve forms of reporting to and communication with the public (No. 25.4)

- **NGOs look forward to the publication of the 2006 Audit report** by the National Audit Authority. Although publication of the Audit Report was publicly announced for June this year, publication was delayed. At the most recent meeting of the Technical Working Group on Public Financial Management Reform on 14 September, the Ministry of Economy and Finance announced that it had given its final approval of the 2006 Audit Report which seemed to be the final step before the NAA could publicize the 2006 Audit Report.
- NGOs note that, if the 2006 Audit report is publicized, the Royal Government has met its target as defined in the PFM Reform program. However, there are a number of issues that the Ministry of Economy and Finance could consider in order to make the documents accessible for the general public. The following three documents are now publicly available:
  - **Budget Documentation:** NGOs appreciate that the Budget Department of the Ministry of Economy and Finance does provide organisations that come to their office with free copies of the four volumes of budget books when they are finalized and published around January/February. Given the limited supply of these books, NGOs recommend the MEF to publish soft-copies on the web-site and deposit hard copies in the National Library and other public libraries.
  - **In year Budget Reports:** Now that the Monthly Bulletin of Statistics is no longer published, the MEF uploads the monthly TOFE on its web-site. NGOs recommend that these are also stored in the national library and other public libraries.
  - **Year End Financial Statements:** This statement is the TOFE that includes an overview of all revenues and expenditures from a full budget year. It is uploaded on the web-site, a few months after the end of the financial year. NGOs recommend that these are also stored in the national library and other public libraries.
- In addition, NGOs would like to recommend to the Ministry of Economy and Finance that the same version of the TOFE it has made available to its development partners is also made available to the general public. The TOFE that is uploaded on the web-site does not provide a breakdown of Government expenditure by line ministries whereas this information is provided to development partners. In the spirit of the second platform of the PFM reform which is to *"increase financial accountability to ensure the efficiency and effectiveness of public financial management through improving the responsibilities of government officials at all levels in their public resource management and use<sup>12</sup>"* **NGOs request that the MEF makes the disaggregated version of the TOFE (both in year and year end) publicly available.**

## 3. Summary of comments and requests on progress in the PFM Reform

- The Cambodians for Resource Revenue Transparency coalition (CRRT) looks forward to receiving a draft of the *"Extractives Industries Fiscal Transparency Plan"* and constructively engage with the Ministry of Economy and Finance and other members of the newly formed inter-ministerial working-group on the management of revenues from oil, gas, and mining resources.

---

<sup>12</sup> Preface of the Public Financial Management Reform Programme, Stage 2

- NGOs would like to learn from the Ministry of Economy and Finance what revenues fall under the reported "*revenue from extractive industry*" in the monthly TOFE that is published on the web-site.
- NGOs look forward to hearing when the 2006 Audit report will be made public.
- NGOs request that the Ministry of Economy and Finance make the detailed version of the monthly TOFE available to the public, in the same way as it makes this information available to its development partners. This detailed version should contain all line ministries figures.
- In order to improve the accessibility of the budget information published by the Ministry of Economy and Finance, NGOs request the MEF to make all its publications available in the national library and other public libraries and put the four volumes with budget information on the web-site.

**For more information on this statement, please contact:**

<b>Cambodians for Resource Revenue Transparency (CRRT) coalition</b>	
Suite 485, Building F, Phnom Penh Center, Corner Street 274&3, Phnom Penh	
Mr. Mam Sambath Chairperson Tel: (855-23) 217-607 Mobile: (855-12) 779 734 Email: <a href="mailto:mam.sambath@citylink.com.kh">mam.sambath@citylink.com.kh</a>	Mr. Chhay Sarath Coordinator Tel: (855-23) 217-607 Mobile: (855-12) 589 958 Email: <a href="mailto:crrtcoordinator@online.com.kh">crrtcoordinator@online.com.kh</a> Website: <a href="http://www.crrt-cambodia.org">www.crrt-cambodia.org</a>
<b>The NGO Forum on Cambodia</b>	
Address: #9-11, st. 476, Toul Tompoung 1, Phnom Penh	
Mr. Chea Kimsong, Development Issues Programme Manager	
Tel: +855 23-214 429 Fax: +855 23 994 063 Email: <a href="mailto:kimsong@ngoforum.org.kh">kimsong@ngoforum.org.kh</a> Website: <a href="http://www.ngoforum.org.kh">www.ngoforum.org.kh</a>	

# Combat Corruption

## 1. Joint Monitoring Indicators

Target	Action Needed	Responsible Government Institution
17. Combat corruption	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. After approval of the penal Code, finalize and approve the draft Anti-Corruption Law based on best international practices, and submit to the National Assembly and Senate for approval.</li> <li>2. Prepare an implementation plan to enforce and manage the implementation of the Anti-Corruption Law.</li> <li>3. Disseminate information on report cases on corruption and conviction on semi-annual basis.</li> <li>4. Develop a clear policy framework on Access to Information.</li> </ol>	MONASRI COM

## 2. Monitoring Progress on Action Needed

### ***2.1 JMI 17.1: Finalize and approve Anti-Corruption Law***

As reported by the Government to the last GDCC meeting, the Draft Anti-Corruption Law sits on the desk of the Council of Jurists /Council of Ministers, and according to sources at the CoM and some public statements by the Government, the draft Law is being reviewed, some changes have been made to the 2006-version, and it will be finalized and sent to the National Assembly after the Penal Code is passed by the latter. Civil society appreciate that the Government has finalized the draft Penal Code and has submitted it to the National Assembly and maintains that the Anti-Corruption Law will follow suit. However, civil society is still concerned about the quality of the Law since there has been no information available as to what changes have been made to the draft law and whether or not recommendations by civil society and international experts are integrated into the draft for it to meet international best practices.

### ***2.2 JMI 17.2 Prepare an implementation plan to enforce and manage the implementation of the Anti-Corruption Law***

Civil society learns that an implementation plan for the Anti-Corruption Law has been drafted and has gone through the internal review. However, ever since 2007, there has been no information available to us on possible progress of the process or whether it has been yet finalized and approved. Civil society therefore would like to call on the Government to provide as much information as possible as to where the Plan stands by now and give a specific timing when it is expected to be finalized and approved.

The approval of the implementation plan for anti-corruption law will enable early preparatory works for an effective implementation of the law on anti-corruption, once it is passed. Failing to do so, will result in a potential time gap between passage of the law and its implementation. The implementation plan would provide pragmatic steps for the government to take to ensure the efficient establishment of a functioning Anti-Corruption Body once the law is passed.

### ***2.3 JMI 17.3 Disseminate information on reported cases of corruption and conviction on semi-annual basis***

Within this monitoring period in particular, civil society have monitored some corruption cases in which public officials were involved. However they are not reported systematically and officially as stated in the JMI. Acknowledging that most of those cases reported by the media were neither substantiated nor reliable, civil society has observed that there were still many cases that were serious enough to be addressed and should have been reported by the Government. Therefore, whether or not it is the Government's intention, civil society can say that this indicator is still not fully met.

#### ***2.4 JMI 17.4 Develop a clear policy framework on Access to Information***

Civil society appreciate the Ministry of National Assembly Senate Relation and Inspection (MoNASRI) for expressing their interest in collaborating with civil society to move forward on Access to Information and on the Policy Paper which will be the foundation of a future Access to Information Law, despite a delay in the previous period. However, seriousness remains to be seen. The draft FOI Policy Paper was supposed to be submitted to the Council of Ministers once completed by the MoNASRI. The fact that the Policy Paper is still with the MoNASRI and never goes to the Council of Ministers makes it questionable again about the real political will of the Government to move forward with the Access to Information. Civil society would therefore like to call on the Government to take the issue seriously by finalizing and approving the draft FOI Policy Paper, which is seen by civil society as well as international experts as a very good paper, by the end of the year.

### **3. Future Directions**

#### ***3.1 JMI 17.1: Finalize and approve Anti-Corruption Law***

The Government should ensure that the draft Anti-Corruption Law be ready for the National Assembly once the Penal Code is passed so that there would be no further delay. In the meantime, the review of the draft Anti-Corruption Law should involve other stakeholders, especially Civil society so that it can be improved, particularly the three outstanding issues of Independence of the Anti-Corruption Body; asset declaration, and whistleblower protection, to ensure that it meets international standards before it is submitted to the National Assembly for debate and enactment. Failing to meet international standard means the indicator is not met and that the Law, if passed, would not be accepted particularly by civil society as a tool effective enough to address corruption.

#### ***3.2 JMI 17.2 Prepare an implementation plan to enforce and manage the implementation of the Anti-Corruption Law***

The Government should move further with the draft Implementation Plan that had been prepared by the MoNASRI to meet the indicator and to ensure that it is designed strictly as a tool for enforcement and implementation of the ACL that meets international standards, once it is passed. Therefore, it should not be just something that would compromise the principle of international best practices of the Anti-Corruption Law, but it is a tool to enable the Government to start well in advance preparing the foundation for a smooth implementation and enforce of the anti-corruption law.

#### ***3.3 JMI 17.3 Disseminate information on reported cases of corruption and conviction on semi-annual basis***

The RGC should develop a systematic reporting tool through which it will regularly report to the National Assembly and the public on the progress made in the fight against corruption. The data to be reported through a public information mechanism should include (but not necessarily be limited to): the number of corruption investigations conducted; number of arrests; number of administrative actions taken; number of convictions and/or administrative dismissals; length of administrative suspension or sentence of convicted criminals, and; estimated monetary impact of the crime committed.

#### ***3.4 JMI 17.4 Develop a clear policy framework on Access to Information***

While congratulating MoNASRI for moving ahead with the drafting of a policy paper on FOI, civil society would like to recommend that the RGC completes its internal review of the Access to Information Policy Paper as quickly as possible, approve it, and by the beginning of next year starts to work on the Policy Paper to develop an Access to Information Law. Further consultations on FOI and an FOI Law is also recommended by civil society.

**For more information on this statement, please contact:**

**People's center for Development and Peace (PDP)**

Mr. Yong Kim Eng, President of PDP

Tel: 016 828 211

Email: [pdpcenter@yahoo.com](mailto:pdpcenter@yahoo.com)

# Midwifery and Enhancement of national response to HIV/AIDS epidemic

## a. Joint Monitoring Indicators

Target	Actions Needed	Responsible Government Institution
4. Increase the proportion of deliveries attended by skilled health personnel in the public sector to 50 % by December 2009	1. Recruitment and deployment of at least 79 midwives for 79 health centers that do not yet have any midwife by the end of 2009	MoH
	2. Provide salary incentives to midwives including to endorse the adapted midwife salary scale and compensation payments for professional related health risks as proposed by MoH. These are to be endorsed at a full session meeting of the Council of Ministers.	MoH
	3. MOH and Health Partners commit to increase both Government and total Health Partner funds to RMNCH in 2009, and to ensure that these resources are reflected in Annual Operational Plans at all levels.	MoH
5. Enhanced national response to HIV/AIDS epidemic	Increasing the percentage of HIV-positive pregnant women to receive anti-retroviral from 30% to 40% by 2009 to reduce the risk of mother-to-child transmission	National AIDS Authority (NAA)

## 2. Monitored progress on Actions Needed

The Ministry of Health (MoH) has developed the Fast Track Strategy (FTS) to address effectively and efficiently the concerned issues. Key successful areas have highlighted as follows: 1) nurses and midwives were currently recruited, trained and deployed in all health centers all over the country. More noticeably, financial incentives (15\$ per delivery) were provided for midwives.

In addition, three of five HIV/AIDS-positives have received anti-retroviral (ARV). This is a great success of HIV/AIDS response to the epidemic in Cambodia. However, women and children are paying with their lives.

People who can't pay are often imprisoned in hospitals until their families can clear their bills. User fees for healthcare continue to exist despite rarely contributing to more than 5% percent of running cost for health services.

Apart from this, another wave of HIV/AIDS epidemic is arising. Men who have sex with men are currently a major threat to the socioeconomic development of Cambodia. Therefore, this threat needs to be addressed immediately.

## 3. Future direction for both government and development partners

Supply and demand of midwives is shaped not just by health needs and numbers of midwives trained, but also by current wages and working conditions relative to other occupations. Shortages can result when government lacks the budgetary resources to provide for nurses and midwives at a competitive salary and to provide them with the supplies and working conditions necessary to perform their jobs.



HIV/AIDS presents human resource for health challenges on multiple levels. HIV treatment increase workloads for health workers and of the workers themselves and impacted by the disease. There is a growing fear that the demand for increases in health workers for HIV/AIDS programs is shifting staff from other priority program, suggesting a need for a comprehensive approach to addressing human resource needs.

**For more information on this statement, please contact:**

**MEDiCAM**

Dr. Sin Somuny, Executive Director  
Tel: (855 23) 880 291  
Fax: (855 23) 880 292  
Email: [ssin@medicam-cambodia.org](mailto:ssin@medicam-cambodia.org)  
Website: [www.medicam-cambodia.org](http://www.medicam-cambodia.org)

## Education

The new 2008/2009 education Joint Monitoring Indicator reflects the importance of addressing survival rates in rural and remote areas. However, a stronger, more coordinated and sustained effort is needed to ensure improved quality of education and access to education for these and other vulnerable populations – those with disabilities, HIV-AIDS, ethnic minorities and the very poor.

### 1. Joint Monitoring Indicators

Target	Action Needed	Responsible Government Institution
3. Increase promotion rate of students in primary education from 78.6% in SY2006-07 to 84% in SY 2008/09	1. Reducing the percentage of incomplete schools from 21% in SY 2007/08 to 18% in SY 2008/09 and deploying 95% of newly trained teachers to under-staffed schools and in remote areas. 2. Revising grade promotion regulation and ensuring implementation of the regulations in education programs supported by development partners.	MOEYS

### 2. Monitored Progress on Action Needed

- Percentage of incomplete schools has been reduced from 21% in SY 2007-08 down to 19% as of December 2008. 95% of new graduate teachers from teacher training colleges have been deployed in 2009 to understaffed schools and remote areas.
- The Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport has issued the revised regulation on grade promotion in March 2009. Those students, from grade 1 to 6, who have scores between 4.0 to less than 5.0 over 10 will be given chances to take examination at the end of school year or early next school year. In addition, results of standardized tests for grade 3 and 6 are also used for grade promotion decision.

### 3. Future direction for both government and development partners

#### NEP recommends that:

- 1) **MoEYS and Development partners work together to ensure a stronger, more coordinated and sustained effort to ensure improved quality and access of education.**
  - i) MoEYS and development partners meet with education NGOs to better understand the current constraints to education quality and access particularly for vulnerable sub-populations, such as children with disabilities, ethnic minority students, children living with HIV/AIDS, and the very poor.
  - ii) MoEYS' Provincial Offices of Education, District Offices of Education and education NGOs establish mechanisms to share information and identify opportunities to work together in a spirit of collaboration to improve education effectiveness.
- 2) **MoEYS continues and intensifies its efforts to ensure the provision of a well trained, motivated teaching force able to match their teaching to the needs of the students.**
  - i) MoEYS maintains well-trained contract teachers in remote schools as these schools will remain under-staffed in the coming years. In remote areas, where

many children are of ethnic minority descent, bilingual community teachers, trained through the MoEYS/UNICEF/CARE pilots should be employed with some form of recognition by the MoEYS.

- ii) Upgrade the quality of the teacher training program and establish a proper support mechanism for newly qualified teachers and schools in order to meet the target with quality
  - iii) MoEYS effectively implements and monitors the policies and master plans on the Child Friendly School and on Education of Children with Disabilities. The implementation of local life skills at cluster or school levels which contribute to competencies laid out in the curriculum standards should be reinforced.
  - iv) Disseminate the Inclusive Education teacher training manuals and train all new teachers in relevant impairment-related teaching techniques, e.g. Braille, sign language, relevant methodology etc.;
- 3) **That discussions on access and performance should be based on accurate, timely statistics**
- i) Regarding promotion rate, monitoring should be controlled performance testing, such as that carried out by the World Bank in 2008, for grades 3 and 6, to ensure that the improved promotion is linked to higher achievement.
  - ii) MoEYS collects statistics on vulnerable children (those with disabilities, HIV-AIDS, ethnic minorities, out of school in catchment school zone, and the very poor) who are currently out of and in school and makes them available nationally by 2010.

**For more information on this statement, please contact:**

**NGO Education Partnership (NEP)**

Mr. In Samrithy, Executive Director  
Tel: (855) 23 224 774 / (855) 12 828 135  
Email: [info@nepcambodia.org](mailto:info@nepcambodia.org) or [dir@nepcambodia.org](mailto:dir@nepcambodia.org)  
Website: [www.nepcambodia.org](http://www.nepcambodia.org)

# **ANNEXES**

# ANNEX 1: Hydropower Development in Cambodia

## Background

The development of Cambodia calls for improved access to cheap and reliable electricity for the country's people and economy. However, the Royal Government of Cambodia's prioritization and rapid development of hydropower dams as a way to meet the country's energy needs remains a serious threat and challenge to the environmental sustainability of the country and the livelihoods and food security of millions of riparian people who depend upon the country's free-flowing rivers.

In the last four years, at least five medium to large hydropower dams have been approved for construction and a further 13 projects have been committed for study. Many of these projects are located in the country's southwest and northeast provinces, and along the Mekong River mainstream. Development of these dams may result in serious impacts to the river's hydrology and quality, which will thus impact the river's ecosystem and fisheries, and the health and livelihoods of the communities who live along them. Cross-border Vietnamese hydropower impacts on Cambodians living along the Sesan River continues to remain an important example of the disastrous impact that hydropower development can have on rural, poor populations. Hydropower projects planned on the Mekong mainstream and its tributaries are especially worrisome given that many of these projects' impacts can not be mitigated and its impacts, especially to the region's fisheries and food security will be far-reaching and severe.

While public accessibility to Environmental Impact Assessments reports has gradually improved in 2009 with civil society access to three project reports, true local-level involvement of civil society organizations and affected communities in development planning processes continues to remain weak and inadequate. Many of the projects' environmental, economic and social impacts remain unaccounted for and unmitigated in project planning documents, while other harms are not fairly remedied or compensated. Comprehensive cost-benefit analyses and energy options assessments are also not being carried out, which are important to energy planning and the identification of more sustainable energy options.

## Recommendations:

In light of these above mentioned concerns and in order to strengthen commitments to poverty reduction, sustainable development and public participation in governance, Cambodian NGOs call upon the Government to:

1. Resolve past and present transboundary water disputes on the Sesan and Srepok rivers;
2. Ensure information regarding hydropower planning is transparent and accessible to the public;
3. Strengthen compliance and regulatory bodies to ensure that the rights of project affected communities are respected and that meaningful public participation is incorporated into the decision making process of project planning;
4. Protect Cambodia's inland fisheries, economy and food security by keeping the Lower Mekong River mainstream free from hydropower dams;
5. Promote decentralized sustainable energy options by improving energy policies and creating incentives to allow alternative energy investors to compete fairly with hydropower companies, by removing barriers that currently prevent alternative energy investment and by developing an energy policy based on efficiency and the needs of Cambodia's people; and,

6. Develop a website for the Technical Working Group on Infrastructure and Regional Integration to make its information accessible to the public, while also inviting NGOs to participate in TWG meetings.

**For more information on this statement, please contact:**

**The NGO Forum on Cambodia**

Mr. Chhith Sam Ath; Executive Director

Tel: 023-214 429

Email: [ngoforum@ngoforum.org.kh](mailto:ngoforum@ngoforum.org.kh)

Website: <http://www.ngoforum.org.kh>

Address: #9-11, street. 476, Sangkat Toul Tompoung 1, Khan Chamkarmorn, Phnom Penh. PO Box: 2295.

# **ANNEX 2: The Rights to Participation in Elections in Cambodia**

## **1. Introduction**

COMFREL submits this report on the rights to participation in Cambodian elections with its focus on the right to vote and universal suffrage. COMFREL performs comprehensive activities related to election monitoring, voter education, voter surveys as well as monitoring the performance of elected officials.

The Royal Government of Cambodia (the "Government") should be praised for signing and ratifying a variety of international human rights treaties especially International Convention on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR). However reports from these activities show that the Cambodian people face difficulties implementing their right to both vote and choose their representatives. This is contrary to International Convention on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR) article 25 which states that. *"Every citizen shall have the right and the opportunity... (a) To take part in the conduct of public affairs, directly or through freely chosen representatives. (b) To vote and to be elected at genuine periodic election which shall be by universal and equal suffrage and shall be held by secret ballot, guaranteeing the free expression of the will of the electors..."*

Cambodia is a constitutional monarchy with a liberal democracy and a multi-party political system. The constitution is the highest law in the country and guarantees the Cambodian people the right to vote and to stand as candidates for election according to articles 34 and 51.

COMFREL appreciates the efforts of the Government and the National Electoral Committee (NEC) in conducting elections. As of 2009, four types of elections using the proportional representation election system have been conducted. The National Assembly elections and commune council elections used a direct party list election system. The Senate elections and Sub-National Council elections (capital, provincial, town, district/khan and council elections) all used an indirect election system.

## **2. The right to vote**

Voter turnout for the direct National Assembly elections has declined markedly from 93.74% in 1998 to 75.08% in 2008. The direct Commune council election, which was first conducted in 2002, saw a similar decline from 87.55% in 2002 to 67.87% in 2007.

In the latest 2008 National Assembly election, COMFREL observed that the technical operation and administration of polling stations during the elections went smoothly. However, irregularities outside of the polling stations caused hundreds of thousands of voters to lose their right to vote.

Results from COMFREL's Voter List and Registration Survey Report 2009 revealed that during the 2008 National Assembly election approximately 440,000 eligible voters who went to cast their vote on polling day could not vote because they could not find their name on the voter list or could not find their polling station code (indicating the polling station location) or its location. COMFREL concluded that voter registration and voter list maintenance were a major obstacle to eligible voters and that the individual's loss of voting rights was a direct result of irregularities in the voter list.

## **3. Universal Suffrage and Election System**

COMFREL appreciates the efforts of the Government in conducting Senate and Sub National Council elections as stated by law. However, the election system of Senate and Sub National Councils does not reflect the principal of universal suffrage. Universal suffrage emphasizes inclusiveness and non-discrimination within the group of persons to

whom the right to vote is granted. Ordinary Cambodian citizens cannot choose their representatives at Senate Level or at the Sub National Council Level and therefore do not enjoy universal suffrage. This has resulted in a loss of public confidence in the electoral system.

Additionally, the Sub-National election system does not reflect the Decentralization and De-concentration reforms of the Cambodian government (D&D) as it relates to the democratic development principle. With no choice offered to the ordinary voter, this system cannot strengthen the accountability of elected officials towards their constituencies.

The proportional system used stipulates that the political parties prepare their candidate list and eligible voters are drawn from existing commune councilors (for Senate elections this includes 123 voters from members of the National Assembly). This system enables commune councilors to elect candidates from the party with which they are affiliated. Commune councilors have elected their political party's candidate rather than their own candidate of choice in both the 2006 Senate elections and the 2009 Sub National Council elections. Hence, the number of seats is proportionate to the current number of commune councilors of the major parties from the Cambodian People's Party (CPP), (7,993 commune councilors), the Sam Rainsy Party (SRP) (2,660 commune councilors), the Norodom Ranariddh Party (NRP) (425 commune councilors) and FUNCINPEC (274 commune councilors) and results can be easily forecast for the Senate or Sub National Council elections. The 2009 indirect elections results of the sub national council shows the presence of capital, provincial, municipal and district councilors only from the CPP (2,551 seats), the Sam Rainsy SRP (579 seats), NRP (44 seats) and FUNCINPEC (61 seats).

Most political parties have no clear democratic procedures for the selection of candidates for their party list. Furthermore, the party has the power to remove the candidate from their position even when they hold an elected seat.

During the 3<sup>rd</sup> Legislature of the National Assembly at least 13 members of National Assembly were removed from their position as they held conflicting viewpoints on policy from their political party. This resulted in their resigning from the party and the subsequent loss of their National Assembly seat. There were also similar instances at the commune council level.

This kind of indirect election system, in which the voter is a member of political party, results in the National Assembly and commune council majority party having a disproportionate amount of control over all indirect elections.

COMFREL concludes that the proportional system along with indirect elections in Cambodia does not ensure the independence of the elected official. Independent citizens are also unable to stand for elections. The right of Cambodian citizens to choose their representative is not represented in Senate and Sub National Council elections.

#### **4. Future direction for both government and development partners**

a. To ensure that eligible voters have their name on the voter list and are able to vote, COMFREL would like to reiterate the recommendation made in our voter list and Registration Survey Report 2009 that the following reforms be made to the voter list:

“As the elections are held every five years, during election year the National Election Committee (NEC) – in cooperation with commune chiefs, commune councilors (two councilors from different political parties), clerks and other local authorities – must be responsible for managing a special voter registration and voter list updating specifically for the elections. The duration for special voter registration and updating should be increased to 120 days to give more time to all voters to check, update or register their name. The NEC should appoint its staff members as chiefs of commune-level voter



registration. There must be a national campaign encouraging and informing voters to register update and check their names. This can be carried out by the NEC, Royal Government of Cambodia, Cambodian Civil Society Organizations (CSOs), political parties and/or other election stakeholders. In addition, election monitoring organizations and political parties can monitor voter registration and voter list updating.”

Before conducting special voter registration and voter list updating, CSOs, as independent organizations, should conduct an audit of the voter list to provide information on accuracy.

Information on the voter list should be cross-verified (using three pieces of data: name, date of birth and gender) with the data on the ID card produced by the Ministry of Interior (MoI). The NEC shall use this information to verify and update the voter list. However, the NEC shall communicate with voters whose data is needed to be verified or updated. The MoI should clean up its data: some donors (such as UNDP) are making efforts to support a project producing ID bio databases.

b. In keeping with the Cambodian Constitution Reform of D&D and ICCPR standards safeguarding the right of the individual to freely choose their representative. COMFREL recommend that all elections, including Senate and Sub-National Council elections should be changed to universal elections. Universal suffrage, allowing Cambodia's whole electorate of ordinary citizens/voters to directly elect the Senate and Sub National Councils and Khan Councils, be implemented and finally allowing the participation of independent candidates who are not affiliated with any political party.

With the recommendation of reforming the council electoral system for next elections that is a better modern liberal democracy can emerge, the electoral system should be changed with two options. The first option is to use the indirect election with preferential system which commune councilors are able to vote for individual candidates; or the second option is to use the direct election In order to avoid high costs, elections can all take place on the same day as National Assembly or commune council elections that just put and add two ballot papers—for senate or sub national council vote. The election system should operate on a mixed voting basis: a proportional system in including political party list and individual candidates should be used. Such elections are being implemented in other Asian countries with similar cultural and economic backgrounds to Cambodia, such as Thailand, Indonesia and the Philippines.

**For more information on this statement, please contact:**

**Committee for Free and Fair Election in Cambodia (COMFREL)**

Mr. Koul Panha, Executive Director

Tel: 023884150

Fax: 023883750

Email: [comfrel@comfrel.org](mailto:comfrel@comfrel.org)

Website: [www.comfrel.org](http://www.comfrel.org)

## ANNEX 3: Disability

### *Introduction*

The NSDP Inclusive Committee provided in September 2009 a statement on the inclusion of disability for the NSDP update. This is the second time that the disability sector is providing an input for the Government-Development Partners Coordination Committee. The first one was the issued in 2008.

The NSDP Inclusive Committee would like to remind its partners and authorities, at the occasion of this meeting that **no specific indicators referring to persons with disabilities are included** in the 43 critical targets/indicators of the NSDP and the JMIs currently used for the NSDP monitoring.

### ***Disability in Cambodia and the need for its inclusion in the NSDP Update 2009-2013 / JMIs***

Welcoming the new *Cambodian law on the Promotion and Protection of Persons with Disabilities* there is growing need to mirror this progress through the inclusion of persons with disability in the JMIs of the updated NSDP. This is because according to United Nations estimates, persons with disabilities represent between 7 and 10% of any country's population. The statistics of World Bank present that 80 percent of people with disabilities live in developing countries and the majority of them live in poverty.<sup>13</sup> Disability increases the likeliness to fall into to poverty and poverty predisposes persons to disability. Thereby, poverty is not only characterized by the lack of finances, but in addition persons with disabilities also face various social and cultural barriers which exclude them from basic services and social life. They have for instance limited access to participation in education, medical care and employment.

**In Cambodia, the CSES<sup>14</sup> 2004 gives an estimation of 4% of people with disabilities** (whereas an ADB survey in 1999 estimated disability at 15%). These data clearly indicate that persons with disabilities are not a marginal minority. Special attention should be paid to the fact that one person's disability and poverty does not only affect her/his own situation, but also the situation of her/his family and the community. Considering their overwhelming presence in the group of the poorest<sup>15</sup>, the current poverty reduction strategy won't reach the Cambodian Millennium Development Goals. Therefore, all efforts should be made to include disability and persons with disabilities in the Cambodian development agenda and respective poverty reduction programs. Cambodia's poverty reduction strategy, the update of the current NSDP should explicitly include the disability sector statement's recommendations from 2009.

Therefore, organizations of and for persons with disabilities welcome the inclusion of disability into the census in Cambodia 2008 since it provides more information on persons with disability. According to the MOP representatives the significantly lower disability prevalence rate as compared to the 4% of the 2004 CSES is mainly due to the methodology applied in the 2008 census. Acknowledging that no perfect methodology has been applied the government therefore recommends to use the two prevalence rates of 4% and 1.4%.

---

<sup>13</sup> [www.un.org/disabilities/default.asp?id=23#current](http://www.un.org/disabilities/default.asp?id=23#current)

<sup>14</sup> NIS/ MOP: CSES: Cambodian Socio-Economic Survey

<sup>15</sup> NIS/MOP: CSES 2004

Cambodian Disabled People's Organization, Disability Action Council and Handicap International on behalf of the NSDP Inclusive committee, would like to suggest that more efforts are made by donors and government to ensure the achievement of **the Cambodian Millennium Development Goals** in accordance with the Nairobi Conference on Victim Assistance and in the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, signed by the Royal Government of Cambodia in 2007.

### ***Recommendation***

To ensure that persons with disability are benefiting from poverty reduction strategies, all development programs could better address the poverty situation of all Cambodian citizens through a more coherent integration of disability in monitoring and strategies. The recommendation list as below:

- 1- Integrating disability references and indicators as a cross-cutting issue into the NSDP Update (2009- 2013) and others sectoral plans/ policies and all development programs.
- 2- Include the Joint Monitoring Indicator on disability for the next CDCF meeting.
- 3- Conduct awareness raising and develop the legal framework for effective enforcement of the Law on the Protection and Promotion of the Rights of People with Disabilities (2009) by 2010
- 4- Promote the implementation of the National Plan of Action for Persons with Disabilities including Landmine and ERW survivors by 2010 nationwide
- 5- Promote disability related adjustment and implementation of sector policies for education, health, employment, gender and gender by 2010

**For more information on this statement, please contact:**

#### **NSDP Inclusive Committee**

Members of the NSDP Inclusive Committee: Action on Disability and Development (ADD), The Association of the Blind in Cambodia (ABC), Cambodian Disabled People's Organization (CDPO), Deaf Development Program (DDP), , Handicap International French Section (HI F) and National Centre of Disabled Persons (NCDP)

Contact organizations: Handicap International, French section, Disability Action Council (DAC) and Cambodian Disabled People's Organization (CDPO)

Contact persons: Mr. Ung Sophea, Project Manager (HI F); Mr. Kham Piseth, Program Manager (CDPO); Mr. Vorn Samphors, Deputy Executive Director DAC;  
Tel: (023) 214 504/ 011 97 58 67 (HI F); 012 702 279 (DAC), 012 542 873 (CDPO),  
Email: [pm-prsp@hicambodia.org](mailto:pm-prsp@hicambodia.org); [pm@cdpo.org](mailto:pm@cdpo.org); [samphors@dac.org.kh](mailto:samphors@dac.org.kh)

## **ANNEX 4: National and International Non-Governmental Organizations on NGO and Association Law**

We note that the NGO sector in Cambodia has positively contributed to reconstruction and social development and continues nation building through the processes of participatory democracy, service delivery in all sectors, capacity building both within government arenas and civil society and through launching humanitarian responses in areas of need. This development work has been positively viewed by civil society, government and donor partners.

Civil society organizations are already registered with the government and have worked towards the establishment of the NGO Code of Ethical Principles and Minimum Standards and the NGO Voluntary Certification System. The NGO Code and certification system gained recognition both nationally and internationally for its role in strengthening civil society in Cambodia.

The Council for Development of Cambodia has noted how governance tools, such as the NGO Code, can play an important role in improving the efficiency and effectiveness of NGO practices, hence furthering the aid effectiveness agenda. In addition, the Code was held up as a role model for improving development practices by the Advisory Group on Civil Society and Aid Effectiveness at the High Level Forum in Accra (Ghana).

Given the above we believe that the current registration processes are adequate to ensure regulation and more importantly are seen as supportive of an “enabling” environment for civil society to exercise its right to engage in participatory democracy.

International and National NGOs have legitimate concerns as to how this law may be interpreted and implemented. This concern focuses on the fact that the legitimacy of civil society to create space for the “voice” of affected communities is being called into question by the government. Multiple statements by government officials claim that NGOs are guilty of “incitement” of communities – a claim raised especially when there are land disputes and affected communities become vocal. NGOs are also berated for being part of the “opposition” when they raise concerns about policy, process or practice by government. In this context the introduction of an NGO law, without adequate consultation and debate, is of grave concern.

We note with regret that the Royal Government has yet to complete its longstanding program of legal and judicial reform, despite the numerous pledges made to the Cambodian people, its civil society, and the international donor community who have provided extensive support to Cambodia.

The NGO community would like to see the creation of an enabling environment which would indicate that a number of laws should go forward, at a minimum in parallel, and some laws such as those guaranteeing an independent judiciary are needed in advance of the NGO law.

Critically the NGO community strongly believes that in line with the Cambodia’s constitution the legislative process establishes and maintains an environment in which there is, and is seen to be, State protection for the freedom of expression, freedom of association and freedom of assembly.

In this context the NGO community recommends donors, agencies and diplomatic offices support a process that recognizes the need for analysis of the potential impact of such a law on civil society as a whole. Such analysis needs to review the scope and scale of the law specifically in relationship to existing mechanisms used by civil society to organize itself including NGO accreditation schemes, associations, non-governmental organizations (NGOs), community based organizations, the media and organized work forces including unions.

In addition INGOs request donors to support a consultative process that allows for dialogue at each stage and which would also help to draft the implementation guidelines allowing for clarity before the Law is ratified.

Finally, we, representatives of international and local non-governmental organizations, as listed below, wish to ask that the Royal Government uphold principles of democracy and make drafts of the law available to civil society, the Cambodian people, the general public and its donor community through a meaningful and broad consultation process.

**We, international and local non-governmental organizations as listed below wish to express our concern at the governments' intention to enact a Law on Local Associations and Non-Governmental Organizations – also known as the NGO law 28-Sep-09.**

1. ACR Australian Catholic Relief / Caritas Australia (ACR/CA)
2. ActionAid International- Cambodia (AAI-Cambodia)
3. Action Environment for Cambodia ( AEC)
4. Action For Health (AFH)
5. Action for Health Development (AHEAD)
6. Adventist Development and Relief Agency Cambodia (ADRA Cambodia)
7. Advocacy and Policy Institute (API)
8. Aide Odontologique Internationale (AOI)
9. Amara (AMARA)
10. American Friend Service Committee (AFSC)
11. Ankor Association for the Disabled (ADD)
12. Ankor Ponleu Wakphiwat (APA)
13. Aphiwat Strey (AS)
14. Asian Outreach Cambodia (AOC)
15. Association Avenir des Femmes et des Enfants du Cambodge (AFEC)
16. Association for Development and Our Village's Rights (ADOVIR)
17. Association for the Protection and Development of the Cambodian Environment (APDCE)
18. Australia Cambodia Foundation, Inc (ACF)
19. Australian People for Health, Education and Development Abroad (APHEDA)
20. Australian Volunteers-International (AVI)
21. Bandos Komar (BK)
22. Battambang Women AIDS Project (BWAP)
23. Bridges Across Borders Southeast Asia (BABSEA)
24. Buddhism development Association and Supporting Environment (BDASE)
25. Buddhism for a Progressive Society (BPS)
26. Buddhist Organization and Indigenous Community Development (BOICD)
27. Cambodia Anti-Tuberculosis Association (CATA)
28. Cambodian Acid Survivors Charity (CASC)
29. Cambodian Center for Human Rights (CCHR)
30. Cambodian Center for Protection of Children's Rights (CCPRC)
31. Cambodian Community Development (CCD)
32. Cambodian Community Saving Federation (CCSF)
33. Cambodian Development Mission for Disability (CDMD)
34. Cambodian Development and Relief Centre for the Poor (CDRCP)
35. Cambodia for Peace (COP)
36. Cambodian Health and Human Rights Alliance (CHHRA)
37. Cambodian Health Committee (CHC)
38. Cambodian HIV/AIDS Education and Care (CHEC)
39. Cambodian Independent teacher Association (CITA)
40. Cambodian Islamic Development Community (CIDC)
41. Cambodian League for the Promotion and Defense of Human Rights (LICADHO)
42. Cambodian League of Women Organistaion (CWLD)
43. Cambodian Organisation for Assistance to Families and Widows (CAAFW)
44. Cambodian Organisation for Women's Support (COWS)
45. Cambodian Peacebuilding Network (CPN)
46. Cambodian Researchers for Development (CRD)
47. Cambodian Save Children Network (CSCN)
48. Cambodian Vision In Development (CVD)
49. Cambodia World Family Krong Kep (CWF-Kep)

50. Care International in Cambodia (CARE Cambodia)
51. Caring for Young Khmer (CYK)
52. Caritas Cambodia (Caritas Cambodia)
53. Center for Advance Study (CAS)
54. Chab Dai Coalition (CHAB DAI)
55. Chet Thor (CHETTHOR)
56. ChildFund Cambodia
57. Children and Life Association (CLA)
58. Children and Women Development Centre in Cambodia (CWDC)
59. Children's Surgical Centre (CSC)
60. Christ For Development Kampuchea (CDK)
61. Christian Aid (CA)
62. Christian and Missionary Alliance (CAMA)
63. Christian Care For Cambodia (CCFC)
64. Church World Service (CWS)
65. Community Economic development (CED)
66. Community For Transformation (CFT)
67. Community Sanitation and Recycling Organization (CSARO)
68. Cooperation for Christian Development in Cambodia (CCDC)
69. Cooperation Committee for Cambodia (CCC)
70. Co-operation for Development of Cambodia (CoDeC)
71. Cooperazione e Sviluppo (CESVI)
72. Coordination of Action Research on Aid and Mobility (CARAM Cambodia)
73. Community Legal Education Center (CLEC)
74. CORD South & East Asia (CORD)
75. Danchurch Aid (DCA)
76. Development Initiative Community Organisation (DICO)
77. Development and Partnership in Action (DPA)
78. Diakonia (DIAKONIA)
79. Digital Divide Data (DDD)
80. Disability Development Services Pursat (DDSP)
81. Douleurs Sans Frontieres (DSF)
82. Educational Supporting Center "KIZUNA" (ESC)
83. End Child Prostitution Abuse and Trafficking in Cambodia (ECPAT-Cambodia)
84. Environment Protection and Development Organization (EPDO)
85. Family Health International France (FHI)
86. FH Cambodia (FH Cambodia)
87. Fine Art Association (FAA)
88. Forum Syd (FS)
89. Friends International (FI)
90. Friends Without A Border-CBHEP (FWAB-CBHEP)
91. Gender and Development for Cambodia (GAD/C)
92. Groupe de Recherche et d'Echanges Technologiques (GRET)
93. Hagar (HAGAR)
94. Handicap International Belgium (HIB)
95. Handicap International France (HIF)
96. Health Unlimited (HU)
97. Helen Keller International (HKI)
98. Help Our Homeland (HOH)
99. HIV/AIDS Prevention Organization (HAPO)
100. Human Resource Development for Community Sustainability Organisation (HRDCSO)
101. Human Resource and Natural Development (HRND)
102. Interchurch Organization for Development Co-operation (ICCO)
103. International Volunteers of Yamagata (IVY)
104. Intervida Cambodia
105. Japan International Center for the Rights of the Child (C-Rights)
106. Japan International Volunteer Center (JVC)
107. Japan Lay Missionary Movement (JLMM)
108. Japan Team of Young Human Power (JHP)
109. Khmer Chivit Thmei Organization (KCTO)
110. Khmer Community Development Association (KCDA)
111. Khmer Farmer Association (KFA)
112. Khmer Kampuchea Krom for Human Rights and Development Association (KKKHRDA)
113. Khmer Institute for Peace and Development (KIPD)
114. Khmer National Community Economic Development (KNCED)
115. Khmer Organisation for Rural Committee Development (KORCD)

116. Khmer Rural Development Association (KRDA)
117. Khmer Volunteer Organisation (KVO)
118. Khmer Youth Association (KYA)
119. Kienkes Health Education Network (KHEN)
120. KNK Network Cambodia (KNK)
121. Kompea Aphiwat And Bondoh Bandal (KABB)
122. Krousar Yoeung (KrY)
123. Kunathor (KNT)
124. Life and Hope Association (LHA)
125. Lutheran World Federation/Department for World Service (LWF)
126. Malteser International (MHD)
127. Maryknoll Cambodia
128. Meakea Aphiwadh (MEAKEA)
129. Meato Phum Komar/Homeland (MPK)
130. Médecins Sans Frontières Belgium (MSF-B)
131. Medical Teams International (MTI)
132. Medicam (MEDiCAM)
133. Mennonite Central Committee (MCC)
134. Mine Advisory Group (MAG)
135. Mission of Generous Cambodian Alliance (GENEROUS)
136. Mith Samlanh (Friends)
137. Mlup Promviheathor Centre (MPC)
138. MoPoTsyo Patient Information Centre (MoPoTsyo)
139. My Village (MVI)
140. Nak Akphivath Sahakum (NAS)
141. Neutral and Impartial Committee for Free and Fair Election in Cambodia (NICFEC)
142. New Humanity (NH)
143. NGO Education Partnership (NEP)
144. NGO Forum on Cambodia (NGO Forum)
145. Non Timber Forest Products Project (NTFP)
146. Norwegian People's Aid (NPA)
147. NPO Hearts of Gold (HG)
148. Nyemo Cambodia NGO (Nyemo Cambodia)
149. Operation Enfants Du Cambodge (OEC)
150. Oxfam
151. Partner in Compassion Cambodia (CP)
152. Partners for Development (PFD)
153. Partnership for Development in Kampuchea (PADEK)
154. Phare Ponleu Selpak (PPS)
155. PH-Japan Foundation (PHJ)
156. Peace Project Centre (PPC)
157. People Development and Peace Center (PDP)
158. People's Forum on Cambodia, Japan (PEFOC, J)
159. Phnom Neang Kangrei Association
160. Plan International Cambodia (Plan Cambodia)
161. Ponleu Sokhappeap (PSP)
162. Ponleur Kumar (PK)
163. Promvihearthor Organization
164. Pteah Teuk Daung (PTD)
165. Pure Religion Orphanage of One in Love Ministry (PROLM)
166. Puti Komar Organization (PKO)
167. RACHANA (RACHANA)
168. Rainbow Foundation (RBF)
169. Reproductive Health Association Cambodia (RHAC)
170. Rural Animal Health Development Organization (RAHDO)
171. Rural Area Kids Organisation (RAKO)
172. Rural Development Association (RDA)
173. Rural Friend for Community Development (RFCD)
174. SABORAS (Saboras)
175. Sahmakum Teang Tnaut (STT)
176. Salvation Center of Cambodia (SCC)
177. Samaki Thor (SKT)
178. Sareka Cambodian Children's Arts (Sareka)
179. Save the Children Australia (SCA)
180. Save the Children Norway- Cambodia (SCN)
181. Save the Earth Cambodia (STEC)

182. School of Public Health and Social Work of St. Elizabeth (SPH- SWSE)
183. Services for the Health in Asian and African Regions (SHARE Cambodia)
184. Shanti Volunteer Association (SVA)
185. Silaka (SILAKA)
186. Society Development Association of Buddhism (SDAB)
187. Socio- Economic Development Organisation of Cambodia (SEDOC)
188. Sor Sor Troung (SST)
189. Soutien a L'initiative Privee Pour L'Aide a la Reconstruction (SIPAR)
190. Sprouting Knowledge Orphan (KEO)
191. Star Kampuchea (STAR KAMPUCHEA)
192. Srer Khmer (Srer Khmer)
193. Sunrise Children's Villages in Cambodia (SCVC)
194. Support Association for Rural Farmers (SARF)
195. Support Rural Children Organization (SRCO)
196. The Cambodia Health Education Media Services (CHEMS)
197. The Lake Clinic- Cambodia
198. Transcultural Psychosocial Organisation Cambodia (TPO-Cambodia)
199. Trotrung ning Akpiwat Sokapheap neak Kreykror (TASK)
200. Urban Sector Group (USG)
201. Veterans International/Cambodia (VI/C)
202. Vicheasthan Bamreu Neaksamrabsamroul Karngae Akphiwat (VBNK)
203. Village Economic Support Organization (VESO)
204. Village Focus International (VFI)
205. Village Support Group (VSG)
206. Vocational training for Alleviation of Poverty and Social Development (VAPSD)
207. Voice of Democracy (VOD)
208. Voluntary Service Overseas (VSO)
209. Vulnerable People Support (VPS)
210. Vulnerability and Illiteracy Reduction (VIR)
211. Wathnakpheap (WP)
212. Weak Family and Youth Development organization (WFYD)
213. Wholistic Development Organization (WDO)
214. Women's Service Organization (WOSO)
215. World Vision Cambodia (WVC)
216. Youth Council of Cambodia (YCC)

**For more information on this statement, please contact:**

**The Cooperation Committee for Cambodia**

Mr. Borithy Lun; Executive Director

Tel: 023-216 009

Email: [info@ccc-cambodia.org](mailto:info@ccc-cambodia.org)

Address: #9-11, street. 476, Sangkat Toul Tompoung 1, Khan Chamkarmorn, Phnom Penh.



**គណៈកម្មាធិការអង្កេតមើលលទ្ធផល ដើម្បីតាមដានលទ្ធផល  
សុចនាករបស់វេទិកាកិច្ចសហប្រតិបត្តិការអភិវឌ្ឍន៍កម្ពុជា  
NGO Committee for the Monitoring of CDCF Indicators**



This NGO Statement on the Monitoring of CDCF Indicators can be accessed through the website of The NGO Forum on Cambodia:  
<http://www.ngoforum.org.kh/eng/core/index.php?pages=dppdoc>